1 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT MIDDLE DISTRICT OF TENNESSEE 2 NASHVILLE DIVISION 3 4 UNITED STATES OF AMERICA No. 3:15-cr-037-2 5 VS 6 BENJAMIN EDWARD HENRY BRADLEY) 7 8 9 BEFORE THE HONORABLE ALETA A. TRAUGER, DISTRICT JUDGE 10 TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS 11 November 29, 2018 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 2.1 Roxann Harkins, RPR, CRR Official Court Reporter 22 801 Broadway, Suite A837 Nashville, TN 37203 615.403.8314 2.3 2.4 roxann_harkins@tnmd.uscourts.gov 25

APPEARANCES: 1 2 For the Government: CECIL VanDEVENDER Asst. U.S. Attorney 110 Ninth Ave S., Suite A961 3 Nashville, TN 37203 4 5 For the Defendant: ROBERT LYNN PARRIS 200 Jefferson Avenue, Ste 1500 6 Memphis, TN 38103 7 MELISSA M. SALINAS (via phone) 8 University of Michigan Law School 9 363 Legal Research Building 801 Monroe Street 10 Ann Arbor, MI 48109 11 DAVID B. SMITH (via phone) 108 North Alfred Street 12 First Floor 13 Alexandria, VA 22314 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 2.1 22 2.3 2.4 25

1

2

3

4

5

The above-styled cause came to be heard on November 29, 2018, before the Hon. Aleta A. Trauger, District Judge, when the following proceedings were had at 11:06 a.m. to-wit:

6

7

8

9

10

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

2.0

2.1

22

2.3

2.4

25

THE COURT: Good morning. We're here on a status conference in *United States versus Benjamin Bradley*. We have for the government Cecil VanDevender. Good morning.

MR. VanDEVENDER: Good morning,

12 Your Honor.

THE COURT: And for Mr. Bradley we have in the courtroom Robert Parris from Memphis. And then I understand we have on the phone David Smith in Alexandria, Virginia; is that right?

MR. SMITH: Yes, Your Honor. I'm having great difficulty hearing what's going on, so if everyone could speak into the microphone, I think I'll be able to hear properly.

THE COURT: Okay. I'll try to --

MR. SMITH: Otherwise it doesn't work.

THE COURT: Very good. And we also have Melissa Salinas from Ann Arbor. And she has with her a law student, Emerson Bursis; is that right?

MS. SALINAS: That's right, Your Honor.

Thank you.

2.0

2.1

2.3

2.4

THE COURT: Okay. Have you-all had any discussions about how you wish to approach the issues that were remanded in terms of the forfeiture fact-finding in terms of Mr. Bradley's involvement in this conspiracy?

Mr. VanDevender looks like he has something to say, he's coming to the podium. And he will speak into the microphone.

MR. VanDEVENDER: Thank you. Good morning, Your Honor. We have had a brief email exchange and then Mr. Parris and I have chatted a little bit. As I understand it, the defendant intends to file a motion to dismiss the forfeiture allegations. And there's been some discussion of kind of the timing for the briefing of that.

At the same time we've had some very preliminary discussions about whether there might be a possibility of resolving the outstanding forfeiture issues with an agreed resolution.

And so I think what we might propose is basically set a briefing schedule that would allow both the brief to be completed and allow the parties a little bit of time just to kind of see if adjudication

```
1
     of that might be avoided.
 2
                   So perhaps I'd propose maybe the
 3
     defendant's brief filed in early to midJanuary in
 4
     light of the holidays, then maybe give us 30 days to
 5
     respond. But I'm flexible if the Court had other
 6
     ideas.
 7
                               Okay. Who will be filing
                   THE COURT:
 8
     this motion, Mr. Parris or Ms. Salinas or whom?
 9
                   MS. SALINAS:
                                 That would be me.
10
                   THE COURT: Okay.
11
                  MS. SALINAS:
                                 The law clinic. Yeah, I
12
     will file that.
13
                   THE COURT: All right. And so how about,
14
     do you want to say by January 11 you would file the
15
     motion?
16
                  MS. SALINAS:
                                 That's fine, Your Honor.
17
     Thank you.
18
                   THE COURT:
                               Okay. And then the
19
     government wants 30 days to respond. Is that right,
2.0
     Mr. VanDevender?
2.1
                                     Yes, please,
                  MR. VanDEVENDER:
22
     Your Honor.
2.3
                   THE COURT:
                               That's fine. And then I'll
2.4
     give -- Ms. Salinas, I'll give you 14 days to file a
25
     reply. I often find replies very helpful.
```

1 MS. SALINAS: Thank you. 2 THE COURT: So we'll just deal with it in 3 that manner, and if in the meantime you-all can 4 resolve how we're going to deal with this, I would 5 welcome that. So is there anything else we need to 6 discuss? 7 Your Honor, this is David MR. SMITH: 8 Smith. We think our motion may be slightly over the 9 20-page motion limit that we believe you have in your 10 court. And I'm wondering if we could ask you now for 11 a few extra pages beyond that because it's a pretty 12 heavy motion --13 THE COURT: Okay. 14 MR. SMITH: -- with a lot of cutting 15 edge -- well, two very cutting-edge issues that are 16 really issues of first impression for --17 What -- would you like 25 THE COURT: 18 pages or 30 pages? What are you thinking? 19 Well, 30 pages would be MR. SMITH: 20 plenty. I think we could probably do it in 25 pages. 2.1 THE COURT: I'll give you 30. 22 MR. SMITH: So we can have up to 30? 2.3 THE COURT: Yes, you may. 2.4 That would be great. MR. SMITH: 25 THE COURT: And the government may also

1 have 30 pages for its response. Let's try to limit 2 the reply to 10 pages. Okay? All right, folks. 3 MS. SALINAS: Thank you. 4 THE COURT: I am very troubled by 5 forfeiture in criminal actions, and I welcome whatever 6 you can do to modify the present system. I think 7 saddling defendants who have spent years in jail with 8 large forfeiture judgments is very unfair. 9 And so I welcome whatever you can do to 10 change this process so that when people finish paying 11 their debt to society, which they think they have done 12 when they have served years in prison, they also are 13 not saddled with large judgments. 14 So I will set out an order with this 15 briefing schedule and look forward to your arguments. 16 Anything else? 17 MR. VanDEVENDER: Not from the 18 government, Your Honor. 19 THE COURT: Very good. Thank you. 2.0 MS. SALINAS: Nothing for us, thank you. 2.1 THE COURT: We're in recess. 22 (Which were all of the proceedings had in 2.3 the above-captioned cause on the above-captioned 2.4 date.) 25

1 REPORTER'S CERTIFICATE PAGE 2 3 I, Roxann Harkins, Official Court Reporter 4 for the United States District Court for the Middle 5 District of Tennessee, in Nashville, do hereby 6 certify: 7 That I reported on the stenographic machine 8 the proceedings held in open court on November 29, 9 2018, in the matter of UNITED STATES OF AMERICA v. 10 BENJAMIN EDWARD HENRY BRADLEY, Case No. 3:15-cr-037-2; 11 that said proceedings were reduced to typewritten form 12 by me; and that the foregoing transcript is a true and 13 accurate transcript of said proceedings. 14 15 This is the 7th day of December, 2018. 16 17 s/ Roxann Harkins ROXANN HARKINS, RPR, CRR 18 Official Court Reporter 19 2.0 2.1 22 2.3 2.4 25